BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES STATE OF HAWAII

In the Matter of Contested Case Regarding Water Licenses at Honomanu, Keanae,)	DLNR File No.: 01-05-MA
ahiku, and Huelo, Maui)	¥
)	

ORDER FOR A&B TO COMMENCE THE ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW PROCESS AND DEFERRING DECISION ON PETITIONERS' MOTION TO ESTABLISH SCOPE OF RECONVENED CONTESTED CASE PROCEEDINGS

On January 9, 2015, Petitioner Nā Moku Aupuni O Ko'olau Hui (Nā Moku) filed a Motion to Establish Scope of Reconvened Contested Case Proceedings (Petitioner's Motion). Alexander & Baldwin, Inc. and East Maui Irrigation Company, Ltd. (collectively A&B) filed a Memorandum in Opposition to Petitioner's Motion to Establish Scope of Reconvened Contested Case Proceedings on March 27, 2015. Petitioners filed a Supplemental Memorandum in Support of Motion to Establish Scope of Reconvened Contested Case Proceedings on March 27, 2015. A&B filed a Response to Petitioners' Supplemental Memorandum in Support of Motion to Establish Scope of Reconvened Contested Case Proceedings on April 10, 2015. Nā Moku filed a Reply in Support of Petitioner's Motion to Establish Scope of Reconvened Contested Case Proceedings on April 10, 2015.

The Board of Land and Natural Resources (Board) held oral arguments on Petitioner's Motion on May 8, 2015. During the oral argument, Nā Moku agreed to withdraw its objection to A&B doing an environmental assessment, which objection had originally been asserted at the May 25, 2001 meeting of the Board. The parties also agreed that the Board would defer decision making on the motion until further notice and to facilitate discussion between the parties regarding the lawsuit pending in circuit court¹ (2015 lawsuit) and an environmental assessment.

Carmichael, et al., v. Board of Land and Natural Resources, et al., Civ. No. 15-1-0650-04 RAN.

On June 15, 2015, the parties submitted a status report to the Board regarding the initiation of discussions between the parties. Nā Moku re-confirmed the withdrawal of its objection to A&B preparing the environmental review documents in connection with its application for a lease. The parties also agreed on a framework for initiating work on the environmental review process. The parties were still in discussion regarding the disposition of the 2015 lawsuit. Nā Moku was to request the BLNR to defer action on Petitioner's Motion while the parties continue discussions on beginning the environmental review process prior to the Commission on Water Resource Management's (CWRM) final decision on the petitions to amend interim instream flow standards (IIFS) in east Maui. No further filings were received from the parties.

Petitioner's Motion argued that the contested case should be reconvened for the Board to require the timely preparation of an environmental assessment to disclose the impacts of the diversion of water from the four license areas (Honomanu, Keanae, Huelo and Nahiku) pursuant to revocable permits S-7263 (Honomanu), S-7264 (Huelo), S-7265 (Keanae) and S-7266 (Nahiku). Petitioner's Motion also urged to Board to reconvene the contested case in order for the Board to address its obligations pursuant to Hawaii Revised Statutes chapter 171.

During oral argument it became apparent that the key issue was the commencement of the environmental review process. Based on the records in this case and the argument presented to the Board, the Board orders A&B to commence the environmental review process in support of A&B's application for a lease of water from the license areas of Honomanu, Keanae, Huelo and Nahiku. The Board will defer decision making on Petitioner's Motion at this time.

Within sixty (60) days of this order A&B must provide to the Board a scope of work for the preparation of an environmental assessment or an environmental impact statement. The scope of work should distinguish those portions that can be undertaken prior to CWRM's final

decision on the petitions to amend IIFS in east Maui from those that require a decision from the CWRM prior to completion.² The scope of work should address, at a minimum, the content requirements contained in Hawaii Administrative Rules § 11-200-10 for an environmental assessments or § 11-200-17 for an environmental impact statement. Accompanying the scope of work should be a tentative schedule for commencement and completion of the various portions of the scope of work.

SO ORDERED this 14th day of April, 2016.

SUZANNE D. CASE³

Presiding Officer

Board of Land and Natural Resources

The Board notes that on January 5, 2016 A&B announced that it would be transitioning out of farming sugar and would instead pursue a diversified agricultural model for its HC&S plantation on Maui. To the degree that the decision to transition away from sugar cane cultivation affects the ability of or timing for A&B to complete portions of the environmental review documents that should be noted in the scope of work.

The Board members have delegated authority to Suzanne Case to sign this Order on behalf of the Board.

BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES STATE OF HAWAI'I

In the Matter of Contested Case Regarding Water Licenses at Honomanu, Keanae, Nahiku, and Huelo, Maui)	DLNR File No.: 01-05-MA
)	

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the following document:

1. ORDER FOR A & B TO COMMENCE THE ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW PROCESS AND DEFERRING DECISION ON PETITIONERS' MOTION TO ESTABLISH SCOPE OF RECONVENED CONTESTED CASE PROCEEDINGS

was duly served upon the following parties as indicated, by means of State Messenger or U.S. Mail, postage prepaid on April 14, 2016, addressed as follows:

Alan T. Murakami, Esq. Camille K. Kalama, Esq. Ashley K. Obrey, Esq. Summer L. Sylva, Esq. 1164 Bishop Street, Suite 1205 Honolulu, Hawai'i 96813

David Schulmeister, Esq. Elijah Yip, Esq. 1000 Bishop Street, 10th Floor Honolulu, Hawai'i 96813

Isaac Hall, Esq. 2087 Wells Street Wailuku, Hawai'i 96793

Robert H. Thomas, Esq. 1600 Pauahi Tower 1001 Bishop Street Honolulu, Hawai'i 96813 Patrick Wong, Esq.
Caleb Rowe, Esq.
Kristin Tarnstrom, Esq.
Dept. of Corporation Counsel
County of Maui
200 S. High Street
Wailuku, Hawai'i 96793

Linda L.W. Chow, Esq.
Land/Transportation Division
Department of the Attorney General
Kekuanaoʻa Building
465 South King St., Room 300
Honolulu, Hawaiʻi 96813

Dated: Honolulu, Hawai'i

K. Tiger Mills

Department of Land & Natural Resources

State of Hawai'i

Civil No. 19-1-0019-01 (JPC)
Defendant A&B/EMI's Exhibit AB-19
FOR IDENTIFICATION
RECEIVED IN EVIDENCE
CLERK